

# Supplemental Materials

Committee on Academic and Workforce Success

## AGENDA ITEM V-C

Consideration of adopting the staff recommendation to the Committee relating to the report on the Fiscal Year 2019 Annual Review of Low-Producing Programs

RECOMMENDATION: Approval

### Background Information:

Additional materials will be provided prior to the March 20, 2019, Committee meeting with regards to programs that staff recommends the institutions' governing board will consider for closure or consolidation.

The staff recommendation to the Board of the THECB includes new programs recommended for closure or consolidation, based on the Fiscal Year (FY) 2019 review, in preparation for the systems' or institutions' Legislative Appropriation Requests (LAR) for the 2022-23 biennium. The list of low-producing degree programs is available on the agency's website at [www.thecb.state.tx.us/LPP](http://www.thecb.state.tx.us/LPP).

Texas Education Code, Chapter 61, Subchapter C, Section 61.0512 (f), authorizes university systems or, where a system does not exist, the institution to close or consolidate low-producing programs at institutions of higher education. Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) staff may recommend the closure of a non-exempt degree or certificate program to an institution's system or governing board, if the program has been on the annual list of low-producing programs for three or more consecutive reviews (Texas Administrative Code (TAC), Rule 4.290).

The FY 2018 list of low-producing programs was approved at the April 2018 Board meeting. At the time, THECB staff did not make new recommendations for consolidation or closure. The Board of the THECB approved staff recommendations at its July 2017 Board meeting, so that institutions could discuss and decide on appropriate action together with their systems or governing boards, as intended by statute, during the year prior to the submission of the LAR for the 2020-21 biennium. Programs that are not consolidated or closed pursuant to THECB recommendation must be identified on the system's or institution's LAR.

TAC Chapter 4, Subchapter R, Rules 4.285 through 4.290 provide the process THECB staff follow regarding the periodic review of low-producing degree programs at public institutions of higher education. In order for a degree program to be identified as low-producing, the number of its graduates is, over a cumulative five-year period:

- fewer than 25 graduates for undergraduate programs;
- fewer than 15 graduates for master's programs; and
- fewer than 10 graduates for doctoral programs.

New degree programs are exempt from the low-producing review for the first five years of operation. Master's degree programs that lead directly to a doctoral degree are exempt. The number of graduates of applied associate degree programs and corresponding certificate programs are combined for low-producing purposes. Second major graduates are counted separately.

If a system or institution is required to identify a degree program on its LAR, the system or institution should also develop a plan to allow the degree program to achieve the minimum standard for the degree awarded, or if the standard is not attainable, provide a rationale describing the merits of continuing the degree program.

Dr. Rex C. Peebles, Assistant Commissioner for Academic Quality and Workforce, will present this item and be available to answer questions.

**Report on the 2019 Annual Review of Low-Producing Programs**

In July 2013, the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) adopted changes to its rules for the annual review of graduates of degree program from Texas public institutions of higher education, as required by Texas Administration Code (TAC), Title 19, Chapter 4, Subchapter R, Rules 4.285 through 4.290, which were first adopted in April 2010. These rules were passed to implement the requirements of Texas Education Code (TEC), Chapter 61, Subchapter C, Section 61.0512 (f), which authorizes the THECB to make recommendations for consolidation or closure of degree programs.

The TAC defines the process THECB staff follow to determine which programs are low-producing. In order for a degree program to be identified as low-producing, the number of its graduates is, over a cumulative five-year period:

- fewer than 25 graduates for undergraduate programs;
- fewer than 15 graduates for master's programs; and
- fewer than 10 graduates for doctoral programs.

New degree programs are exempt from the low-producing review for the first five years of operation. Master’s degree programs that lead directly to a doctoral degree are exempt. The number of graduates of applied associate degree programs and corresponding certificate programs are combined for low-producing purposes. Second major graduates are counted separately.

**The 2019 Annual Review of Low-Producing Programs**

The 2019 report of the low-producing degree programs review includes graduates of programs from Academic Year (AY) 2012 through AY 2018. Approximately 6,400 programs were reviewed and 182 programs were identified as low-producing.

Of the 182 programs identified as low-producing, 101 programs have been low-producing for three or more consecutive reviews. The 2018 report identified about the same number of programs, 112 programs, as low-producing for three or more consecutive reviews. Of those programs, 25 were closed or consolidated at the request of their institution, and 14 increased the number of graduates and were no longer low-producing.

<b>LPP Action</b>	<b>2015 Review</b>	<b>2016 Review</b>	<b>2017 Review</b>	<b>2018 Review</b>	<b>2019 Review</b>
Review of three 5-year periods	<b>AY 08-14</b>	<b>AY 09-15</b>	<b>AY 10-16</b>	<b>AY 11-17</b>	<b>AY 12-18</b>
<b>Total LPP</b>	<b>181</b>	<b>178</b>	<b>190</b>	<b>206</b>	<b>182</b>
LPP three years in a row	17	54	118	112	101
Sufficient graduates the following year to not be LPP	37	26	33	43	NA*
Closed or consolidated the following year	11	15	8	31	NA*
Recommended for close-out	2	0	118	0	101

\* NA, not available at this time: number of programs closing, consolidating in response to the recommendation of this review, or increasing graduates in AY 2019.

## **Recommendations to Close or Consolidate Low-Producing Programs**

The THECB is authorized to make recommendations to close or consolidate low-producing degree programs. These recommendations are made to the governing board of a public institution of higher education or directly to an institution, if it does not have a governing board.

Recommendations to close or consolidate are made for non-exempt degree programs that have been on the annual list of low-producing programs for three or more consecutive reviews. If a governing board does not accept the recommendation and retains the low-producing program, the university system (or the institution, where a system does not exist), identifies the low-producing program(s) recommended for closure or consolidation on its next Legislative Appropriations Request (LAR). In those situations, a system or institution also needs to develop a plan for a low-producing program to achieve the minimum graduation standard, or if the standard is not attainable, provide a rationale that details the merits of continuing the low-producing program.

THECB staff makes recommendations to the Board for closure or consolidation of low-producing programs in odd numbered years, while systems and institutions submit their LAR in even numbered years. This allows systems and institutions ample time to decide on appropriate action, in the year prior to the submission of their LAR.

The list of low-producing degree programs is available at [www.thecb.state.tx.us/LPP](http://www.thecb.state.tx.us/LPP). THECB staff annually notify governing boards and institutions, if they do not have a governing board, about programs that have not met the standards for three consecutive years and whether the programs will be recommended for closure or consolidation.

The low producing program list that follows shows, by system and institution, the 101 programs identified as low-producing for three or more consecutive reviews. Staff recommends closure or consolidation for those programs. Programs on this list that are not closed or consolidated and that do not sufficiently increase the number of graduates, will be identified on the system's or institution's LAR for the 2022-23 biennium.

## **Recommendations from Previous Years' Reviews**

The list of low-producing programs includes programs that had been recommended for closure or consolidation in 2017, but have not been closed or consolidated and have not sufficiently increased the number of graduates. The list of low-producing programs of the 2017 report was approved by the Board at its July 2017 meeting along with the recommendation to close or consolidate 118 low-producing programs. This allowed the institutions and their systems time to decide on appropriate action in the year prior to the submission of the LAR for the 2020-21 biennium.

The low-producing programs that were recommended to be closed or consolidated in the 2017 report are identified on the list and whether the systems or institutions identified them on their LAR. Ten programs were not identified on the LARs for the 2020-21 biennium, submitted by systems or institutions.

The list also includes programs identified in the 2018 report as low-producing for three consecutive reviews. The 2018 list of low-producing programs was approved by the Board at its

April 2018 meeting. THECB staff did not recommend programs for closure or consolidation, as systems and institutions would not have time to decide on appropriate action prior to submission of the LAR for the 2020-21 biennium. These programs are now recommended for closure or consolidation.

Low-Producing Programs for <i>Three Consecutive Reviews</i> and Recommended for Closure or Consolidation 2019 Report			Review Year			THECB Report Year <sup>1</sup>	LAR <sup>2</sup>
			17	18	19		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods				
Non-System - Community and Technical Colleges							
Angelina College	Diagnostic Medical Sonography/Sonographer and Ultrasound Technician	AAS	22	14	20	2019	–
Austin Community College	Engineering-Related Technologies	AAS	21	22	24	2017	NR
Austin Community College	International Business	AAS	23	17	22	2019	–
College of the Mainland	Emergency Medical Technology/Technician (EMT Paramedic)	AAS	10	19	23	2017	NR
Hill College	Heavy/Industrial Equipment Maintenance Technologies	AAS	11	2	5	2017	NR
Lee College	Criminal Justice & Corrections	AAS	24	23	18	2017	NR
Northeast Texas Community College	Agricultural Business and Management	AAS	17	19	20	2017	2020-21
Texarkana College	Marketing	AAS	0	0	0	2017	NR
Wharton County Junior College	Graphic Communications	AAS	7	8	13	2017	NR
Alamo Community College District							
Alamo Community College District - Northwest Vista College	Environmental Control Technologies/Technicians	AAS	19	21	21	2019	–
Alamo Community College District - Palo Alto College	Electromechanical and Instrumentation and Maintenance Technologies/Technicians	AAS	4	2	0	2017	NR
Texas State Technical College District							
Texas State Technical College-Waco	Physical Science Technologies/Technicians	AAS	22	18	16	2019	–
Texas State Technical College-Waco	Building/Construction Finishing, Management, and Inspection	AAS	1	7	10	2017	2020-21
Texas State Technical College-West Texas	Computer Software and Media Applications	AAS	0	7	16	2019	–

<sup>1</sup> Report Year a low-producing program was first recommended for consolidation or closure.

<sup>2</sup> Biennium for which the low-producing program was identified on a system’s or institution’s Legislative Appropriation Request (LAR). Accessed at <http://www.lbb.state.tx.us/>, March 2019. “NR” means the program was not reported on the LAR; “–” means that reporting was not yet required. If not closed, consolidated, or improved, all programs must be identified on the 2020 LAR by their systems or institutions.

List of Low-Producing Programs <i>Three Years in a Row</i> and Recommended for Closure or Consolidation <i>Continued</i>				Review Year			THECB Report Year	LAR
				17	18	19		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five-Year Periods					
Non-System – Universities								
Midwestern State University	Humanities	BA	13	10	9	2019	–	
Midwestern State University	Global Studies	BA	23	22	22	2019	–	
Midwestern State University	Political Science	MA	13	13	13	2019	–	
Non-System – Universities								
Stephen F. Austin State University	Forestry	PHD	9	7	8	2017	2020-21	
Stephen F. Austin State University	School Mathematics Teaching	MS	5	5	8	2017	2020-21	
Stephen F. Austin State University	Philosophy	BA	16	17	15	2019	–	
Stephen F. Austin State University	Chemistry	BS	20	20	22	2017	2020-21	
Stephen F. Austin State University	Economics	BA	11	12	12	2017	2020-21	
Texas Southern University	Spanish	BA	22	21	19	2017	2020-21	
Texas Southern University	Art	BA	21	20	13	2017	2020-21	
Texas Woman's University	Family and Consumer Sciences	BS	23	18	19	2019	–	
Texas Woman's University	Medical Technology	BS	6	7	12	2017	NR	
Texas A&M University System								
Prairie View A&M University	Clinical Adolescent Psychology	PHD	9	9	5	2017	2020-21	
Tarleton State University	Environmental Science	MS	10	12	12	2017	2020-21	
Tarleton State University	History	MA	14	13	8	2019	–	
Texas A&M International University	Bilingual Education	MS	9	6	2	2019	–	
Texas A&M University	Veterinary Public Health - Epidemiology	MS	11	11	13	2019	–	
Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi	History	MA	13	14	13	2019	–	
Texas A&M University-Kingsville	Music Education	MM	4	6	10	2017	2020-21	
Texas A&M University-Texarkana	Adult and Higher Education	MS	11	14	14	2019	–	
West Texas A&M University	Art	BA BS	20	18	18	2017	2020-21	
West Texas A&M University	Studio Art	MFA	10	11	11	2017	2020-21	

List of Low Producing Programs <i>Three Years in a Row</i>			Review Year			THECB	LAR
			AY 17	AY 18	AY 19		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods				
<i>Continued</i>							
-							
Texas State University System							
Lamar State College-Port Arthur	Mental and Social Health Services and Allied Professions	AAS	8	11	18	2017	2020-21
Lamar State College-Port Arthur	Accounting and Related Services	AAS	14	16	23	2017	2020-21
Lamar University	Environmental Studies	MS	10	7	4	2017	2020-21
Lamar University	General Business-Advertising	BBA	11	14	13	2017	2020-21
Lamar University	General Business-Retail Merchandising	BBA	1	1	3	2017	2020-21
Lamar University	Biochemistry	BA	7	7	10	2019	-
Lamar University	Forensic Chemistry	BS	8	6	4	2019	-
Lamar University	Music-Music Business	BA	0	0	0	2019	-
Lamar University	History	MA	8	6	10	2017	2020-21
Sam Houston State University	Family and Consumer Sciences	MS	9	11	9	2017	2020-21
Sam Houston State University	Composite Science	BS	0	0	0	2017	2020-21
Sam Houston State University	Philosophy	BA	23	23	22	2019	-
Sam Houston State University	Psychology	MA	2	1	6	2019	-
Sul Ross State University	Computer Science	BS	9	14	22	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Industrial Technology	BS	7	3	5	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Spanish	BA	10	8	8	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Theatre	BFA	14	17	15	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Biology	MS	14	13	13	2019	-
Sul Ross State University	Mathematics	BS	17	16	10	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Chemistry	BS	2	1	1	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Geology	MS	10	10	12	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Psychology	MA	1	0	0	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Social Science	BA	6	7	3	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Political Science	BA	9	7	6	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Political Science	MA	2	3	2	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Art	BFA	11	10	11	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Art	MA	5	5	6	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University	Music	BM BA	11	11	13	2017	2020-21

<b>List of Low Producing Programs Three Years in a Row</b> <i>Continued</i>			<b>Review Year</b>			<b>THECB</b>	<b>LAR</b>
			<b>AY 17</b>	<b>AY 18</b>	<b>AY 19</b>		
<b>Institution</b>	<b>Program</b>		<b>Graduates Over Five Year Periods</b>				
<b>Texas State University System</b>							
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Reading Specialist	MED	5	1	3	2017	2020-21
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Biology	BS	21	20	19	2019	-
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Mathematics	BS	21	17	17	2019	-
Sul Ross State University Rio Grande College	Social Science	BA	20	22	18	2017	2020-21
<b>Texas Tech University System</b>							
Texas Tech University	Land Use Planning, Management, and Design	PHD	5	4	4	2017	2020-21
Texas Tech University	Microbiology	MS	11	9	8	2017	2020-21
Texas Tech University	Interdisciplinary Arts Studies	BA	0	0	0	2019	-
<b>The University of Texas System</b>							
The University of Texas at Arlington	Communication	BA	0	0	0	2019	-
The University of Texas at Arlington	Geoinformatics	BS	5	7	6	2019	-
The University of Texas at Arlington	History	PHD	0	0	0	2019	-
The University of Texas at Austin	Architectural History	MA	7	7	3	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	Latin American Studies	PHD	4	4	4	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	German, Scandinavian, and Dutch Studies	BA	4	4	5	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	Italian Studies	BA	23	19	20	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	Architecture	PHD	7	8	9	2019	-
The University of Texas at Austin	Islamic Studies	BA	10	11	11	2017	NR
The University of Texas at Austin	Jewish Studies	BA	7	8	6	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	Dance	MFA	4	1	1	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	Music Composition	BM	9	8	10	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Austin	Jazz	BM	17	17	22	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at Dallas	Bioinformatics and Computational Biology	MS	8	10	8	2017	2020-21

List of Low Producing Programs <i>Three Years in a Row</i> <i>Continued</i>			Review Year			THECB	LAR
			AY 17	AY 18	AY 19		
Institution	Program		Graduates Over Five Year Periods				
The University of Texas System							
The University of Texas at El Paso	Chicano Studies	BA	23	20	19	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas at El Paso	Education	MA	7	7	7	2017	NR
The University of Texas at El Paso	Geophysics	BS	7	5	3	2019	-
The University of Texas at San Antonio	Neurobiology	PHD	9	8	7	2019	-
The University of Texas at San Antonio	Anthropology	PHD	7	7	7	2019	-
The University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston joint with The University of Texas M.D. Anderson Cancer Center	Biomedical Sciences-Quantitative Sciences	PHD	0	0	0	2019	-
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	Personalized Molecular Medicine	MS	2	2	1	2019	-
The University of Texas Health Science Center at San Antonio	Medical Health Physics	MS	13	10	8	2019	-
The University of Texas Medical Branch at Galveston	Medical Science Research	MMS	10	9	9	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Information Systems	BS	19	22	22	2017	2020-21
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Biology	MS	12	8	8	2019	-
The University of Texas of the Permian Basin	Leadership Studies	BA	14	11	6	2017	2020-21
University of Houston System							
University of Houston	Space Architecture	MS	8	3	2	2019	-
University of Houston	Engineering Management	MEMGMT MS	6	1	0	2017	2020-21
University of Houston	Italian Studies	BA	12	11	14	2019	-
University of North Texas System							
University of North Texas	Behavioral Sciences	PHD	8	7	8	2017	2020-21